# Site Description

#### 4.1 **Urban Context**

The Manly Reservoir is located within a principally residential area, dominated by one, two and three storey dwellings and apartment blocks. The dominant element within the local area is a multi-storeyed building separated from the subject site by Hilltop Crescent.



Figure 4.1 Aerial view of the Manly Reservoir, showing its urban context as a principally residential zone Source: nearmap

> Manly Reservoir Planning Proposal Statement of Heritage Impact November 2013 Graham Brooks & Associates Pty Ltd

4.0





Figure 4.2

Three storey residential development diagonally opposite the subject site, at the corner of Ashley Parade and Fairlight Street



Figure 4.3

Single storey residential development at the corner of Fairlight Street and Hilltop Crescent, directly opposite the site



Figure 4.4 View looking north up Ashley Parade. The reservoir site is at the top of the hill on the right of the image.







#### Figure 4.6

View looking south from the eastern side of the site along the access road between the properties at 38 and 40 Upper Clifford Avenue



Figure 4.7 View from the site looking south towards the adjoining residential development

Manly Reservoir Planning Proposal Statement of Heritage Impact November 2013 Graham Brooks & Associates Pty Ltd

.

#### 4.2 Description of the Reservoir Site

The former Manly Reservoir is a rectangular rock cut structure. Owing to the rocky outcrop, the sides have been built up in a gravity section concrete wall to an even height. Existing vehicle access to the site is provided directly off Ashley Parade.

The reservoir presents with remnant features typical of older water supply infrastructure, including outbuildings, the 1960s roof, metal wall cladding, handrails, ladder and valve chambers. The dominant component of the reservoir visible from the street is that of the 1960s roof structure; the original 1890s rock-and-concrete structure is obscured from public view.

A stone and concrete block wall on the eastern side of the reservoir forms a terrace where the elevator tank is thought to have stood between 1916 and 1924.





#### Figure 4.8 View of the redundant Manly Reservoir, looking from Hilltop Crescent. Note that the principal fabric visible from the streetscape is the 1960s metal clad roof structure.

Figure 4.9 View of the Manly Reservoir looking south east along Fairlight Street



Figure 4.10

Corner of the subject site, at the intersection of Fairlight Street and Ashley Parade



Figure 4.11 Laneway along the property boundary looking west to Ashley Parade



Figure 4.12 Site view of the Manly Reservoir structure







View of the rock and concrete reservoir structure showing access ladder and drainage



Remnant steps, retaining wall and terrace, and c.1920s brick fence



Figure 4.16 Detail showing part of the interwar-era brick fence



Figure 4.17 Detail showing part of the curved 1920s fence



Figure 4.18 South west corner of the reservoir



Figure 4.19 View from terrace showing the south east corner of the reservoir



Residential dwelling adjacent to (east of) the reservoir site and storage/equipment shed within the site



Figure 4.21 On-site redundant W.C.



Figure 4.22 Detail of reservoir structure

Figure 4.23 Reservoir detail, likely to have been carried out at the same time the reservoir was enclosed (1960s)

8

28



Figure 4.24 Postwar access ladder on the side of the reservoir



Figure 4.26 View along the side of the reservoir



Figure 4.25 Postwar addition to the site



Figure 4.27 Detail showing position of former pumping equipment

## Assessment of Heritage Significance

# 5.0

#### 5.1 Introduction

Heritage, or "cultural" value is a term used to describe an item's value or importance to our current society and is defined as follows in *The Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter*, 1999, published by Australia ICOMOS (Article 1.0): *Cultural significance* means **aesthetic, historic, scientific** or **social** or **spiritual value** for past, present or future generations.<sup>1</sup>

Significance may be contained within, and demonstrated by, the fabric of an item; its setting and relationship with other items; historical records that allow us to understand it in terms of its contemporary context, and in the response that the item stimulates in those who value it.<sup>2</sup> The assessment of significance is not static. Significance may increase as more is learnt about the past and as items become rare, endangered or illustrate aspects that achieve a new recognition of importance.

Determining the cultural value is at the basis of all planning for places of historic value. A clear determination of significance permits informed decisions for future planning that will ensure that the expressions of significance are retained and conserved, enhanced or at least minimally impacted upon. A clear understanding of the nature and degree of significance will determine the parameters for, and flexibility of, any future development.

The Sydney Water S170 Register entry for Manly Reservoir includes the following Statement of Significance for the site, Manly Reservoir (WS 0064):

Manly Reservoir (WS 64) is a fine example of a 19th century below-ground reservoir although originally unroofed (not covered). It is one of the 3 main structures of the Manly Water Supply Scheme, which was independent of the Sydney Water Supply, the other structures being Manly Dam and Bantry Bay Reservoir (WS 8).

This section reviews the criteria used to evaluate the significance of the site and its components in its current context as a redundant infrastructure facility, applying the standard evaluation criteria to the facts of the item's development and associations to update the Statement of Significance.

2 ie "social" or community, value

30

<sup>1</sup> The Burra Charter The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, (1999), p.2.

#### 5.2 Analysis of Cultural Significance

The following commentary discusses how each of the criterion established by the New South Wales Heritage Office (now the Heritage Division of the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage) relate to the subject site.

# Criterion (a) – An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

The Manly Reservoir at the corner of Fairlight Street and Ashley Parade forms part of the nineteenth century water supply system for the local area. This was one of only two independent water supply systems constructed in the metropolitan area. It was built in 1892 by the NSW Department of Public Works, for Manly Council, and passed into the control of the Board in 1902

It is one of the three main structures of the Manly Water Supply Scheme - the others being Manly Dam and the Bantry Bay Reservoir. The site reflects the late nineteenth century campaign for a potable water supply, although it was effectively made redundant by 1933. It was briefly returned to use for a period of 10 months in 1941, but with this exception has remained disused to the present day.

#### Criterion (b) - An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

The Reservoir does not have any strong or special association with an individual or groups of significance in the Manly area.

# Criterion (c) - An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area)

At the time of construction, the Manly Reservoir demonstrated a good and structurally sound example of late nineteenth century engineering and construction. The structure comprised a rock and concrete belowground reservoir, with the sides built up in concrete to an even height to form a gravity structure. The site includes an interwar-era fence and remnant and/or replacement equipment, access ladders, etc. Although the original intention appears to have been to construct an enclosed reservoir, the eventual result was an unroofed structure, which was not covered with a roof until the 1960s, well after it was made redundant. This 1960s roof structure is the dominant visual element on the site.

Criterion (d) - An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons



The Reservoir does not have associations with a particular community or cultural group in the Manly area.

#### Criterion (e) - An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

As an individual element, the defunct reservoir does not have particular potential to yield specific technological information that will contribute to a greater understanding of the Manly area, as it depended upon the context of the broader Manly Dam water supply system, which has been severed since the 1930s. Built components on the site have been removed, replaced and/or upgraded since its construction, including the 1920s/1930s fence, pumping equipment, 1960s roof structure etc. It has long been disused and decomissioned. In general terms, it serves as an example of late nineteenth century water supply infrastructure development in the metropolitan area.

#### Criterion (f) - An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

The Reservoir was constructed by the NSW Department of Public Works as one of two independent water supply systems in the metropolitan area, before being taken over by the Water Board in 1902. As a functional built element, the reservoir in itself is not uncommon, rare or endangered as a large number of reservoirs were constructed throughout the metropolitan area in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The various elements on the site have been modified and/or replaced as required thorughout the twentieth century. It is an interesting example whereby the original structure was unroofed until the 1960s period, some time after it had been rendered redundant.

#### Criterion (g) - An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments (or a class of the local area's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments)

The reservoir structure demonstrates one component of the early water supply infrastructure of the local area. In conjunction with the Manly Dam and pumping station and the Bantry Bay reservoir, it served a vital role within the Manly community.



#### 5.3 Statement of Significance

The Manly Reservoir, located at the corner of Ashley Parade and Fairlight Street, was constructed as part of the wider Manly water supply system, one of only two independent water supply networks throughout the metropolitan area.

Built in 1892 by the NSW Department of Public Works for the benefit of Manly Council, the Reservoir was an example of significant late nineteenth century infrastructure in the area, enabling the local population to draw on a reliable potable water supply without recourse to artesian wells or rainwater. The structure comprised a rock and concrete belowground reservoir, with the sides built up in concrete wall to an even height to form a gravity structure. The site includes an interwar-era fence and remnant and/or replacement equipment, access ladders, etc. Although the original intention appears to have been to construct an enclosed reservoir, the eventual result was an unroofed structure, which was not covered with a roof until the 1960s, well after it was made redundant. The 1960s roof structure is the most visually dominant element on the site.

The reservoir was supplemented in 1924 by the construction of Bantry Bay elevated reservoir, which effectively rendered the Manly service reservoir redundant by the early 1930s following the adoption of the western Sydney dams as the primary potable water supply for the Manly district. Few modifications have been carried out on the structure, being limited to the 1916 addition (and subsequent removal in 1924) of an elevated tank stand, construction of a brick fence c.1920s, the occasional removal and replacement of equipment during the 1930s-1940s period, and the installation of the metal-clad roof structure over the reservoir between 1961-1965.

As an isolated, long-disused and decommissioned element, the reservoir itself does not provide significant information about the nineteenth century water supply system, but its high geographic location above the Manly township demonstrates its former function, and the structure illustrates its role. When viewed in a broader context with the Manly Dam and surrounds, the reservoir may be appreciated as an early, vital component of water supply infrastructure for the local area.

#### 5.4 Grading of Signficance

The Manly Reservoir has been carefully assessed to determine a relative grading of significance into five levels. This process examines a number of factors, including:

> Relative age Original design quality Degree of intactness and general condition Extent of subsequent alterations Association with important people or events Ability to demonstrate a rare quality, craft or construction process

Grading reflects the contribution the element makes to overall significance of the item (or the degree to which the significance of the item would be diminished if the component were removed or altered).

#### EXCEPTIONAL SIGNIFICANCE

Includes rare or outstanding building fabric that displays a high degree of intactness or can be interpreted relatively easily,

#### HIGH SIGNIFICANCE

Includes the original extant fabric and spaces of particular historic and aesthetic value. Includes extant fabric from the early phases of construction.

#### MODERATE SIGNIFICANCE

Includes building fabric and relationships which were originally of higher significance, but have been compromised by later, less significant modifications.

#### LITTLE SIGNIFICANCE

Includes most of the fabric associated with recent alterations and additions made to accommodate changing functional requirements. These are components generally of neutral impact on the site's significance.

#### INTRUSIVE

Recent fabric, which adversely affects the significance of the site.

Grading has been established as a valuable tool, to assist in developing appropriate conservation measures for the treatment of the building and its various elements. In general, good conservation practice encourages the focussing on change, or upgrading of, an historical building/site to those areas or components, which make a lesser contribution to significance. The areas or components that make a greater or defining contribution to significance should generally be left intact or changed with the greatest care and respect.

SITE ELEMENTS	GRADING OF SIGNIFICANCE
There are no elements of the Manly Reservoir considered to be of Exceptional significance	EXCEPTIONAL
Stone and concrete reservoir structure	HIGH
Remnant equipment 1920s brick fence Stone retaining wall	MODERATE



1960s metal-clad roof structure Mesh fences Outbuildings	LITTLE
There are no elements of the Manly Reservoir considered to be Intrusive	INTRUSIVE

#### 5.5 Curtilage

The early operational curtilage of the Manly Reservoir included Manly Dam. This has been severed by the decommissioning of both redundant structures.

Manly Dam, now part of a large recreational area known as Manly Warringah War Memorial Park, is included on the NSW State Heritage Register (SHR). The SHR curtilage for Manly Dam does not include Manly Reservoir.

Sydney Water's S170 Register entry for the Manly Reservoir identifies its curtilage as limited to Lot 1, DP 745080, as shown in Figure 5.1.



Figure 5.1 Curtilage of the Manly reservoir site (WS 0064) Source Item 4575789, WS 0064, Sydney Water

#### 5.6 Conservation Policies

Conservation of heritage items can be regarded as the management of change. It seeks to safeguard that which is important in the built environment within a process of change and development. As the functionality of the Manly Reservoir has been completely removed it is inevitable that any future use of the site will require intervention to the existing fabric. The following policies have been prepared to guide the formulation of future proposals for adaptation of the redundant water supply facility.

#### Policy 1

Procedures for managing change for the site should be in accordance with the recognised conservation methodology of the Burra Charter.

#### Policy 2

Adaptation of the reservoir structure and its internal space is acceptable, providing the existing fabric and visual bulk and scale of the structure is respected.

#### **Policy 3**

Partial demolition of the concrete and stone walls of the reservoir is acceptable, providing sufficient fabric is kept to retain its architectural character.

#### Policy 4

Elements identified as being of little significance, such as the reservoir roof structure and cladding and ancillary structures, may be removed.

#### Policy 5

Removal of remnant Sydney Water infrastructure equipment from within the reservoir for use elsewhere is acceptable.

#### Policy 6

Any surplus redundant infrastructure element, such as pumping equipment, should be retained on site and used for interpretation.

#### Policy 7

Additional openings to the brick fence are acceptable provided they are detailed in a sympathetic manner and do not affect the curved corner.

#### **Policy 8**

Removal or modification of the stone retaining wall on the eastern side of the reservoir is acceptable provided the stone is salvaged and used elsewhere on the site.

#### Policy 9

The introduction of new buildings within, and adjacent to, the reservoir structure is acceptable provided they are designed to retain the urban memory of the former infrastructure use and allow appreciation of the retained fabric.

#### Policy 10

Any new structures introduced to the site should be clearly distinguishable as new and their materiality should respect and complement that of the reservoir.

#### Policy 11

An archival recording of the site and its urban context should be prepared prior to its future development.

#### Policy 12

An Interpretation Strategy should be prepared and implemented with any future development for the adaptive re-use of the site to enable the former role of the site to be understood and appreciated.



### Assessment of Heritage Impact

The NSW Heritage Office (now the Heritage Division of the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage) has published a series of criteria for the assessment of heritage impact. The relevant 'questions to be answered' in the *NSW Heritage Manual* 'Statements of Heritage Impact' guidelines relating to change of use are:

Does the existing use contribute to the significance of the heritage item?

#### Why does the use need to be changed?

What changes to the fabric are required as a result of the change of use?

What changes to the site are required as a result of the change of use?

In addition to those above, the following questions have been formulated in determining the heritage impact of changing the LEP controls for the site:

What are the potential heritage impacts for this item arising from the future development of the subject site under the current planning controls?

What are the likely consequences of the Planning Proposal?

How can adverse heritage impacts be mitigated?

These are considered below in relation to the impact of rezoning the redundant water supply facility at the Manly Reservoir site.

The decommissioned Manly Reservoir has long been a disused infrastructure element within the local area, and as such has no existing use. As a result, its defunct state does not make a contribution to the significance or role of the place.

The use of the redundant water supply facility site is to be changed as it has no functionality and the site is surplus to the needs of Sydney Water.

Although partial demolition of the existing structure is implied in a change of use that will allow its development for residential purposes no physical changes are proposed to the structure, or the site, as part of this Planning Proposal.

As the functionality of the Manly Reservoir has been completely removed it is inevitable that any future use of the site will be for adaptive re-use and will require intervention to the existing fabric.

> Manly Reservoir Planning Proposal Statement of Heritage Impact November 2013 Graham Brooks & Associates Pty Ltd

60

The current planning controls pertaining to the subject site permit development for water infrastructure services with no restrictions on set back, height or floor space.

It is proposed to change the use of the property under the LEP 2013 from special uses to residential use consistent with height, density and floor space controls applicable to the surrounding built development in its vicinity.

The likely consequence of the Planning Proposal is that the site will be sold and developed for residential use. It is considered that the potential adverse heritage impacts of future development can be adequately mitigated in the preparation of a proposal in accordance with the conservation polices in this report.

Any future development of the site will require approval from Manly Council and will be subject to the heritage provisions of the Manly *LEP 2013* and the guidelines of the *Manly DCP 2013*, and will be assessed accordingly.

### **Conclusions and Recommendation**

- The redundant Manly Reservoir site is currently listed as an item of local heritage significance in Schedule 4 of the Manly LEP 1988
- The redundant decommissioned Manly Reservoir has no functionality and the site is surplus to the needs of Sydney Water. As the functionality of the reservoir has been completely removed it is inevitable that any future use of the site will be for adaptive re-use and will require intervention to the existing fabric.
- The current planning controls pertaining to the subject site permit development for water infrastructure services with no restrictions on set back, height or floor space.
- The Planning Proposal seeks to amend the zoning controls currently applying to the site and to impose height and density controls consistent with the adjoining residential locality in the Manly LEP 2013.
- Under this proposal the site will remain a locally listed heritage item in Schedule 5 of the Manly LEP 2013.
- Future development of the site for residential purposes will require approval from Manly Council and will be subject to the heritage provisions of the Manly LEP 2013 and the guidelines of the Manly DCP 2013, and will be assessed accordingly.
- It is considered that the potential adverse heritage impacts of future development can be adequately mitigated in the preparation of a proposal in accordance with the conservation polices in this report.
- As such, the Planning Proposal is considered acceptable from a heritage perspective and is recommended for approval.

7.0

# Bibliography

ARCHIVAL SOURCES

Department of Lands, Real Property Register

Sydney Water Archives

Manly Local Studies Library

State Library of New South Wales

#### **GOVERNMENT SOURCES**

Department of Public Works, Annual Report of the Department of Public Works, N.S.W. 1940-41, Department of Public Works, 1941

Legislative Assembly of NSW, Report of the Department of Public Works for the year 1892, Government Printer, Sydney, 1893

Legislative Assembly of NSW, Report of the Department of Public Works for the year ended 1902, Government Printer, Sydney, 1903

Legislative Assembly of NSW, Report of the Department of Public Works for the year ended 1917, Government Printer, Sydney, 1917

Legislative Assembly of NSW, Report of the Department of Public Works for the year 1923-ended June 1925, Government Printer, Sydney, 1926

NSW Metropolitan Water, Sewerage and Drainage Board, Official Handbook 1913, Government Printer, Sydney, 1913

NSW Royal Commission on Sydney Water Supply, Sydney water supply : first, second and third reports of the Royal Commission, together with minutes of evidence, plans, etc., Government Printer, Sydney, 1903

Parliament of NSW, Department of Public Works Annual Report 1961-62, Government Printer, Sydney, 1963

#### PUBLISHED SOURCES

Aird, W.V., The water supply, sewerage, and drainage of Sydney, Metropolitan Water Sewerage and Drainage Board, Sydney, 1961

Apperly R, Irving R, Reynolds P, A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present, NSW, Angus & Robertson, 2002

Beasley, M., The Sweat of Their Brows: 100 years of the Sydney Water Board 1888-1988, Sydney Water Board, Sydney, c.1988

Hector, D., 'Sydney's Water Sewerage and Drainage System', in *Journal and Proceedings of the Royal Society* of New South Wales, Vol.144, nos. 439-440, 2011.

Manly Reservoir Planning Proposal Statement of Heritage Impact November 2013 Graham Brooks & Associates Pty Ltd

8.0

Henry, F.J.J., The water supply and sewerage of Sydney: being an account of the development and history of the water supply and sewerage systems of Sydney and the South Coast from their inception to the end of the first 50 years of control by a board specially constituted for the purpose, Halstead Press, Sydney, 1939

ICOMOS Australia, The Burra Charter: The Australia ICOMOS Charter for the Conservation of Places of Cultural Significance (Burra Charter), Canberra, Australia ICOMOS, 1999

Manly Council, Manly Local Environmental Plan 1988, Manly Council, Sydney, 1988

Mayne-Wilson W, Heritage Curtilages, NSW Heritage Office and the Department of Urban Affairs and Planning, NSW, 1996

Metropolitan Water, Sewerage and Drainage Board, Amplification of northern suburbs water supply system: January 1969, Sydney, 1969

NSW Heritage Office and Department of Infrastructure Planning and Natural Resources, NSW Heritage Manual, Sydney 2001

NSW Heritage Office, Interpreting Heritage Places and Items Guidelines, NSW Heritage Office, 2005

NSW Legislative Assemby, Sydney Water Supply, V 1 and 2, Government Printer, Sydney, 1902-1904

NSW Metropolitan Water, Sewerage and Drainage Board, Metropolitan Board of Water Supply and Sewerage, Macfarlane, Stahl & Co., Sydney, 1901

NSW Parliament Standing Committee on Public Works, Reports: together with minutes of proceedings, evidence, and appendices relating to the inquiries made by the first Committee appointed under the Public Works Act of 1888, Government Printer, Sydney, 1888

PERIODICALS

The Albury Banner, 1906

The Australian Women's Weekly, 1964

The Evening News, 1892

The Manly Daily, 2012

The Sydney Morning Herald, selected years 1892-43

WEBSITES

http://www.ancold.org.au/?page\_id=24, Australia National Committe, Register of Large Dams in Australia

http://www.engineersaustralia.org.au/sites/default/files/Manly\_Hydraulic\_Lab\_Nomination.pdf, Engineers Australia

22

www.heritage.nsw.gov.au, State Heritage Inventory

www.nearmap.com.au, Nearmap

https://www.opengov.nsw.gov.au/, OpenGov NSW http://photosau.com/Manly/scripts/home.asp, Manly Local Studies Image Library www.six.nsw.gov.au, NSW LPMA Sixviewer www.sl.nsw.gov.au/picman State Library Pictorial Index http://www.sydneywater.com.au/SW/index.htm, Sydney Water http://trove.nla.gov.au/, Trove